Avehi-Abacus Project

Six Monthly Report

April to September 2015
# Contents

1. **Avehi-Abacus Project** ................................................................. 3--5

2. **Sangati Programme** ........................................................................ 6--29
   - At glance developments during the academic year 2014-15 (April to May) 7--22
   - At glance developments during current year 2015-16 (June to Sept. 15) 23--29

3. **Manthan Programme** ..................................................................... 30--41
   - At glance developments during the period of April to Sept 2015

4. **Networking Advocacy** .................................................................... 42--43

5. **The Silver Jubilee Programme of Avehi Abacus Project** ............ 44--45

6. **Work along with Central and State Level Government and other organizations** 46
1. Avehi-Abacus Project

Brief Background:
Avehi means ‘to know’. The Avehi Public Charitable (Educational) Trust APC(E)T founded in 1981 is a media resource centre supporting schools, community organizations, women’s and environmental groups by providing media resources to enrich their work for widening horizons, for raising the level of education and awareness, promoting values of equality, justice, gender parity, secularism, environmental sustainability. In today’s India these words have acquired a sense of urgency. In today’s volatile circumstances we are compelled to connect with our freedom fighters and Constitution makers who earned these conceptions by their sacrifices.

To actualize the vision for a just society Avehi initiated the Avehi Abacus Project in 1990. The Avehi Abacus Project (AAP) believes in improving and strengthening the public education system to reach out to the marginalized sections of society and to impact mainstream policy on education.

The work of Avehi Abacus Project is based on an understanding that education does not function in a vacuum. It exists for a purpose – a purpose that is determined by society. What is this purpose? And how can that purpose be best achieved? What is the role of the school syllabus, the teaching-learning processes and the teacher in this process? These are important questions for any society – and even more so for a society like ours which is so diverse and complex, which is among the world’s fastest-growing economies and yet unable to meet the challenge of fulfilling even the most fundamental needs of a majority of its people.

The following set of Goals have guided the work of the Avehi Abacus Project:

- To influence the quality of teaching-learning in schools.
- To build awareness in children, teachers and planners regarding issues relating to social justice and environmental sustainability.
- To equip children with the skills and values that will help them contribute positively to society and achieve their own potential.
- To empower teachers to become active participants in the educational process.
- To build public opinion and influence policy towards redefinition of the quality aspects of education.
- To actively participate towards influencing policies to institutionalize meaningful and creative teaching-learning curricula within schools.
- To influence policy towards formulation, acceptance and implementation of equal quality free education to all children from 0 to 18 years.
- To foster values that promote harmony and celebrate diversity.
**Sangati programme:**

- The project has developed a three-year enrichment curriculum package – *Sangati* (meaning-harmony/togetherness) comprising of a series of 6 teaching-learning kits with interlinked themes for the Vth to VIIth std classes. The *Sangati* curriculum is thought-provoking and interactive attempting to make school education more relevant and vibrant.
- It has been used in all (905) MCGM schools and has reached more than 10,000 teachers and 2 and half lakh children since last thirteen years. It is also used in a few well-known private schools that engage in innovation across the country.
- The project now envisages further strengthening and sustaining these efforts by working closely with Supervisory Officials of Mumbai Municipal Corporation for smooth integration, better monitoring and sustained use of *Sangati* programme.

**Manthan- Pre-service Teacher Education Module:**

- In addition to the *Sangati* programme, Avehi-Abacus Project has developed a foundation course for trainee teachers studying the Diploma course in Teacher Education (DTEd), comprising 50 learning sessions spread over two years.
- This course was tested in two Government recognized DTEd colleges with 200 students in Mumbai during the period 1998 to 2000. The overall response to the course – from the trainees as well as from the two colleges where the curriculum was tested was highly encouraging.
- On the basis of feedback received from trainees and trainers the process of reviewing and modifying the course was initiated from 2007. This revised course is entitled ‘*Manthan*’ (meaning - Churning). This course is in consonance with the NCF 2010 of the National Centre for Teacher Education (NCTE).
- The project has been granted permission by the Maharashtra State Council for Educational Research and Training for implementing the programme in Panvel District Institute of Educational Training (DIET) and 10 other affiliated colleges.

**Saath Saath Living together in harmony:**

- Responding to the increasing awareness about gender parity and ironically growing violence against the female sex, the Avehi Abacus project has recently developed a kit on Gender titled *Saath Saath* - Living together in harmony.
- The Archdiocesan Board Of Education (ABE) has taken the responsibility to support the dissemination and use of the kits. As part of this process 4 workshops have also been conducted for 145 teachers of 98 ABE schools during August-September 2013.
- The kit has also received positive response in the mainstream media.

**Policy Advocacy and Mainstreaming:**

- The organisation has been actively involved in working for Right to equal quality education for all since the last ten years and building awareness to bring in fundamental changes towards an equitable and public funded school System. Towards this end, the organisation has connected with other likeminded civil society groups and eminent educationist to build State and National level forums.
- The path-breaking, sustained work and implementation in relation to content development has been taken serious note of by the National and State level policy making bodies. Members of Avehi Abacus Project have played a key role in shaping the syllabus and textual material developed for National and State level use. The material developed by the organization has been integrated and used as reference during this process.
Overview of Implementation - in brief

Since its inception in 1990 the Avehi-Abacus project has worked with the Education Department of the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai.

- **1991 to 1995** a pilot programme was developed in one municipal school with one batch of students from class III until class VII. The Core-Team member of AAP was the resource person and conducted the classes in the school twice a week.

- **June 1995 to April 2000**, implementation in 25 municipal schools in Mumbai, (about 200 school teachers and NGO facilitators and 7000 children from class III to class VII.)

- **2001** Based on valuable feedback from the field the material was adapted and published as Sangati in three languages for teachers and Children’s material in 8 languages.

- **June 2001 to April 2004** Implementation in two municipal wards (185 schools, 370 teachers and 21000 children) in Mumbai for children in classes V to VII.

- **June 2001- April 2004**: The Sangati programme became a part of UNICEF’s ‘Life Skill Quality Education Programme’ in the Zilla Parishad schools (in rural and tribal areas) in 2 Blocks in Yawatmal and Chandrapur Districts of Maharashtra. 120 schools, 310 teachers and 12,000 children in Chandrapur and Yawatmal.

- The evaluations at the end of this phase indicated an overwhelmingly positive impact on both students and teachers. Thus Sangati was asked to spread out to all 905 upper primary municipal schools in 24 wards of Mumbai from June 2006 to 2015.

- On an average per academic year Sangatiis used by 1300 teachers with 41000 children.
Sangati Programme

At glance developments during the academic year 2014-15 (April to May)------7-36

- Introduction
- The Objectives of Sangati are
- Sangati Programme Outreach 2014-15
- Sangati Programme (2014-15): Overview
- Sangati Programme has implemented kit 5 and kit 6 for the education year 2014-15
- The consolidation of information of sessions of kit 5 and 6 where the Sangati Programme
- Gammat Goshti/ Activity sheets
- Feedback of Students about Sangati Programme
- Feedback of Teachers about Sangati Programme
- Sangati Programme : Internal Evaluation Report
- Achievements of the Programme
- Challenges faced during Implementation of the Programme

At glance developments during current year 2015-16 (June to Sept. 15):-----37-46

- Sangati Programme Outreach 2015-16
- A brief outline of Kit 1- Myself, My Body, Our Needs
- Sangati Programme (2015-16): Activities
- Sangati Programme Implementation
- School Visits of School Representatives and Coordinators: June to Aug. 2015
- Teachers’ and Student response to Sangati kit 1
2. **Sangati Programme**

At glance developments during the academic year 2014-15 (April to Sept. 15)

2.1 **Introduction: Avehi** Abacus Project’s syllabus formulation started in one of the Mumbai Municipal Schools in 1990 on an experimental basis where the prototype was developed till 1995. The field testing was done from 1995 to 2000 in 25 Municipal Schools by regular teachers and in about 15 Non formal Education classes by the volunteers. From 2000 to 2005 Sangati was used on a wider platform in G- South and F-south North wards in the Mumbai Municipal Schools and in about 180 Zilla Parishad schools in one Block each of Yawatmal and Chandrapur Districts as part of UNICEF’s Learning Enhancement Programme. Implementation of Sangati program started on a wider scale in 2006 in all the Upper Primary Schools of Mumbai Municipal Corporation several external evaluation studies by experts it is being implemented in all the Upper Primary Schools from 2006.

The Municipal Corporation renewed its permission for implementation of Sangati Programme in all the Upper Primary Schools during June 2012 to April 2015 (PPPC/319/20/07/12 and PPC/127/29/07/13). During the academic year 2014-15, Sangati programme was being implemented in all the teachers and students of eight mediums of Mumbai Municipal Schools. Three batches of std V to std VII have undergone Sangati using it as a supplementary, enrichment curriculum. Mumbai Municipal’s Education Department has extended excellent support during the implementation.

2.2 **The Objectives of Sangati are:**

- To help in enhancing the quality of education in schools by enriching and supplementing the regular curriculum
- To help enhance the academic performance of children by making learning relevant and enjoyable
- To build cognitive skills of thinking, analysing and making choices, and to encourage children to consider different opinions while forming and expressing their own
- To enable teachers to refresh their teaching skills to encourage multi-disciplinary teaching, and make teaching participatory and enjoyable
- To provide stimulating reading materials that will help develop children’s reading skills and foster values that promote harmony and celebrate diversity

To Build capacities of project staff in aspects related to changing contexts and challenges of the formal education system

Network with the District Education authorities on effective implementation of the curricular package

Network with National Centre for Educational Research and Training (NCERT- the apex body for curricular and in-service teacher development), National Centre for Teacher Education (the apex body for teacher education) and State bodies like State Centre for Educational Research and Training (the State level body of NCERT), the Maharashtra State Text Book Bureau- (Balbharati) and others for integration of material/approach developed by the Avehi-Abacus project in the government prescribed syllabus and teaching-learning material.
## 2.3 Sangati Programme Outreach 2014-15

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zone</th>
<th>Wards</th>
<th>No of schools</th>
<th>No of classes</th>
<th>No. of participating children in Sangati pro. 2014-15</th>
<th>No of Teachers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zone I</td>
<td>A,B,C,D,E,F/S, F/N,G/S,G/N</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>308</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone II</td>
<td>H/E, K/E, K/W, P/S, P/N, R/S, R/N</td>
<td>335</td>
<td>291</td>
<td>530</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone III</td>
<td>N,S,T,L,M/E, M/W</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>316</td>
<td>548</td>
<td>542</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grant Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>862</td>
<td>806</td>
<td>1386</td>
<td>1302</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- In the academic year 2013-14 Sangati programme was implemented in the 1386 classes from 862 upper primary schools covering 8 mediums. However in the year 2014-15, 84 classes were reduced because 7th standard from 56 schools was dropped. Hence programme outreach for the year 2014-15 was 1302 classes from 806 schools. It has been observed that, most of these 56 schools that did not implement Sangati were Marathi and Gujrathi Medium schools.

- In all 15535 girls and 15141 boys covering total of 30676 children participated in Sangati the programme.

- In all 1302 classes and teachers participated in the programme.
2.4 Sangati Programme: April to May 2015

- **Documentation of details of Participating Students:** Efforts were made to document names and other details of the students who participated in the Sangati programme. Format was created to gather relevant information such as name, age, sex, address, contact number etc. from students. These are to make a useful data-base for further tracking and follow-up.

- **Distribution of Certificates to Participating Students:** Sangati programme was initiated in the year 2012 with students in the 5th standard. Programme continued with these students till they reached 7th standard in the year 2015. In all 30678 students were felicitated by giving certificate of participation in the programme.

- **Documentation of Sangati sessions and other relevant information:** Following important information related to programme was collected and well documented. Information such as: Number of students in std. 7th, Number of students who participated in the programme, number of those students who have Gammat-Goshti files etc. Similarly sessions conducted in the classes were also well documented.

- **Distribution of Certificates to Participating Teachers:** To acknowledge teachers’ contribution in the implementation of the programme in schools and to express gratitude, participation certificates were given to teachers.

- **Evaluation:** In order to gauge impact of the programme, evaluation was conducted in the month of March-15. For this 10% schools and 10% students from these 10% schools were selected as per sampling norms. Feedback about the programme was taken from students and teachers from selected schools. Detail information as regards this will follow.

- **School Visits of School Representatives and Coordinators**

  There are seven Field Coordinators and 45 School Representatives to who monitor implementation of the Sangati Programme. They have taken lot of efforts so that the Sangati is implemented as expected and the messages in the programme reach the students properly.

  **School visits of School Representatives** – the school representatives made 29787 visits to the school while the Sangati programme was being implemented in 2014-15. Out of which, 13028 visits were for sessions and 16850 visits were for follow up.

  **School Visits of Coordinators** – the seven coordinators in the Sangati Programme made 1769 school visits and 2304 class visits. Out of which, 1578 were regular visits, 343 surprise visits and 383 visits were made to the classes having problems. During school visits, they had dialogue with teachers, principals and to the students for smooth functioning of Sangati programme.
2.5 Sangati Programme has implemented kit 5 and kit 6 for the education year 2014-15.

The *Sangati* series consists of six interactive learning kits - two each for Classes V, VI and VII. Each kit consists of a Manual for Teachers and a set of Visual Aids. The titles in the series are:

Kit 1: Myself, My Body, Our Needs  
Kit 2: Our Earth & The Web of Life  
Kit 3: How Societies Developed  
Kit 4: The Way We Live  
Kit 5: Understanding Change  
Kit 6: Preparing For The Future

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zone</th>
<th>No. of Visits by Representatives (Classes)</th>
<th>Visited No of schools</th>
<th>Visited No of classes</th>
<th>No. of Visits by Field coordinator (Classes)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>For observing Sessions</td>
<td>Follow up of Sessions</td>
<td></td>
<td>Regular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone I</td>
<td>3816</td>
<td>5319</td>
<td>513</td>
<td>621</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone II</td>
<td>5122</td>
<td>4847</td>
<td>848</td>
<td>1089</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone III</td>
<td>4090</td>
<td>6684</td>
<td>408</td>
<td>594</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grant Total</td>
<td>13028</td>
<td>16850</td>
<td>1769</td>
<td>2304</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

About Kit 5 Understanding Change and Kit 6 Preparing For The Future

- There has been a great deal of change in human society and in the relationships that human beings have developed - with one another, with other forms of life, and with the environment. It is only by **UNDERSTANDING** these **CHANGES** and analysing their impact that we can learn to deal with them and to create the kind of society we want.

- If we truly want to bring about change, then we need to **PREPARE FOR THE FUTURE**. This means exploring alternatives for a better future for ourselves as individuals as well as for our society and our earth.
2.6 The consolidation of information of sessions of kit 5 and 6 where the *Sangati* Programme

The consolidation of information of sessions of kit 5 and 6 where the *Sangati* Programme was being implemented in Mumbai Municipal Corporation School in the academic year 2014-15, is as follows:

- Average in % of sessions of Set 5 and 6 of *Sangati* Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Session</th>
<th>Kit 5</th>
<th>Kit 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Average in % of sessions of Set 5 and 6 of *Sangati* Programme**

- Session 1 to 10 is completed in 80 to 86% of classes
- Teachers have completed Session 11 to 20 in 80 to 77% of classes successfully.
- Set 5 started in 80% of classes and 77% classes completed all the 20 sessions. This is a very important point.
- After completing Set 5 in 77% classes, teachers started the kit 6 with the same students.
- Kit 6 started in 70% of classes but sessions could be completed only in 50% of classes.
- Kit no 5 was implemented from July to December. Kit 6 started in January. Though got less time to teach set 6, 50% of schools tried to complete the kit.
- Teachers taught very spontaneously as topics in both the sets were very relevant to social and own real life.
Average in % of sessions of Kit 6 ‘Preparing for the Future’ *Sangati* Programme

Zone wise Average in % of sessions of Kit 6 ‘Preparing for the Future’ *Sangati* Programme
Special experiences of the Sessions (Kit No.6: ‘Preparing for the Future’)

1. **M.H.B.P Municipal School No.3 Urdu: Afternoon** Session: Session 2 included the theme of Mi Kon?‘Who am I?’ under which the group activity –‘Asa Tu, Ashi Tu!’ (This is you !) was given by their teacher Ms.Rubina Shaikhwherein the students had to write about each other. Some students were writing sincerely whereas some were doing mischief. The teacher told Jaman that “You do a lot of mischief and will grow up fighting with others”. The teachers got a negative impression of Jaman. One student wrote about Jaman that he helps them with studies, especially while solving sums and is good at sports and singing as well. When their teacher read that he told Jaman that when he is good at so many things, he must sublime them in a positive way. At the same time, the teacher also realized that he also should think twice before remarking about any student.

2. **Transit Camp Municipal School Urdu No.2** Session No.4: Svapratima,Moolyancha Vedh, Self Image, Exploring Values, And Incident 5: While having a discussion, one girl raised her hand and narrated the argument which took place at her home over dowry. She started telling about her elder brother’s wedding. Her grandmother told them that he must take dowry as they will need to give it at the time of her wedding. But her brother was against it. Everyone in the family was against him. At last he told her that she should not get married at all and in turn refused to get married at that time. There is no discussion about his wedding currently. “This incidence happened at my home and that I completely agree with him”, she said.

3. **Kurar Village Marathi Municipal School No.1,Kit.6,Session No.1:** In this session, ‘Don Biyanchi Goshta’ ‘Two seeds’ was read by the teachers showing pictures. To understand its impact, they gave different roles to the students. The dialogues were simple, easy and powerful. Cows, insects enacted their roles exactly according to their nature. One seed was shown to be happy go lucky and the other one to be sad, fearful and distressed. Through this session, the students understood that they should be like the seed which has grown from the soil, face the adversities and prove beneficial to others too.

4. **Mandvi Municipality Hindi School Session No.3:** During the class, the incident about Babu was narrated. In this class, a boy named Pradip is into regularly mischief. Listening to this incident, he also realized that he should be helping others and be good at studies at the same time. He has started paying attention in the class.

5. In Session No.3, students liked the stories - ‘Have tale Manore’ ‘Castles in the air’ and ‘Kay ha chamatkar’ ‘What a Magic This is’. To feel good and positive about oneself is very essential. The second story taught them the importance of hard work and practice which makes any impossible thing possible. Thus they realized that studies, reading, writing is possible with practice.

6. **Charkop Sector Municipal School No.1 Hindi Kit No.6, Session No.5:** In the ‘Jagu Anande’ ‘For daily use’session, the teachers explained about life skill. How to deal with stress was the main focus of the session. The teacher also explained types of
stress and its impact. There was discussion about mistake the 10th and 12th class students make by committing suicide due to stress before exams or after their results. They should be given all this information. Then they will understand their problems and will be able to find way through their stress. Committing suicide is an irresponsible behavior, the student opined.

7. The students from number of schools loved the game of Chinese Whispers. They understood the types of mistakes made while communication, which can result in misunderstandings. Then they realized that they need to pay attention while communicating.

8. Session No 10 – Sheelane Kay Karave (Sheela’s dilemma?) – after listening to the story the students come to a conclusion that Sheela should go out for her job, she should do what she feels right. They also understand that they themselves should do what they feel right.

9. **M.G. Road Municipal Gujarati School** – Session NO 15 – Mukkamachya Dishene – (Getting There) – the students discussed enthusiastically after going through the session. They loved the characters of Santosh Ghabare, Sudha Gandhi, Bha Gavande. They understood how to make progress and realized that they should start thinking about their goal – what they want to become. They realized they can progress if they proceed in the right direction. The students responded positively in the session.

10. Session No 13 – the students participate very enthusiastically in the game – Doke Chalava (Think on your feet!). They understand different techniques to complete their task in the minimum time.

11. Session NO 14 – the students play the game Nembaaji (Bull’s eye!) quite enthusiastically. They understand the importance of planning and regular practice. The story of Sheikh Chilli teaches them that just aspiring something does not get them what they want but they also have to work hard to get it. The Gammat Goshta- Pankh Swapnance – Bal Yojaneche (Dreams and goals) taught them these things.

12. Students love the story– Samrat Akbarhi Dhada Shikato (Emperor Akbar gets an Education) in Session NO 17. They realize that each one of them is learning something in their life and they should learn something new.
2.7 Gammat Goshti/ Activity sheets

Each Gammat Goshta (Activity Sheets), information booklet, Goshti Navalaeechya (Interesting stories) is prepared taking into consideration the age group of students and session. The language therein is very easy and in different languages. Hence, solving the Gammat Goshta, drawing, painting, information about one self, writing experiences, collecting some information, writing notes, interviewing—all the exercises, the students can carry out well. It is reflected in the pamphlet solved by the students. Their writing skill, reading skills are enhanced in solving a Gammat Goshta. Their hidden talent is showcased and is enhanced. The question answers, information is arranged in such a way that someone who has not attended Sangati programme can also solve the same.

Out of the 30678 students who participated in the Sangati Programme, 7363 (24%) students have files. Some students prepared new plastic files because their old files got torn. Students were solving Gammat Goshti enthusiastically and happily. The parents and neighbours have also got involved in Gammat Goshti. Files of some students are well drawn, information is properly filled, they have also written about their hobbies such as poems, drawings, songs etc.
2.8 Feedback of Students about Sangati Programme

Name: Shaikh Zainab
STD: VII
School: Malvan Township English School.

Sangathi is the best subject this is my favourite subject. In our class, Manisha miss is teaching and giving a chat and class teacher is teaching there are chat. We get so many information my favourite chat is Maya ki Kohani she is hardworking girl she doesn't want to marriage but her grand mother is telling to marriage. She wants to study more she get confident Sangathi teach us history, science, geography and stories of kind information we want Sangathi in VIIth std also.

---

मागिते त्या उपक्रम करणे के कारण आतिशिक विद्यार्थिक यें काही सकरात्मक परिणाम हुवू हू रे विद्यार्थी आम्ही एक-दुसरे या समाना करणा सर्वसाधारण असला असेल. एक-दुसरे या भावनांमध्ये या पुढील पर्यंत, ती मिळत भरत संस्कृतीत व भाषा रस्त्यावरील बांधकाम, पायलटास या सौंदर्याची बोलणे, पर्यावरणाची साजर्शण करणे, आदि या उपक्रम करणे का उद्देश्य आहे.

विधिवत कला शैक्षणिकांना भाषामध्ये आणि सध्य्याची उद्देश्यांमध्ये की पुढील करणे का प्रयत्न 'मागिते' द्वारे किंवा आम्ही त्या कार्यक्रमात करून त्या कार्यक्रमात अत्यंत उद्दिष्ट प्रमाण म्हणून पर्यावरणाची रस्त्यावरील बांधकाम. ती बांधकामातून गात गाय आहे ते आम्ही करणे या उपक्रमाची गात हे आति या मागिते म्हणून त्या उपक्रमांची आंदोलन केली जाते - साक्षी.

कृपया किते वि. सरोजी
कहा - मारी (से)
कुरार हिंदी क - 2
भागाद (पृथ्वी)
2.9 **Sangati Programme : Internal Evaluation Report**

**Introduction:**

The Internal Evaluation was conducted in March 2015 to understand the impact of *Sangati* in schools. The selection of schools was done in a random sample method. The evaluation was conducted by seeking written feedback of students and teachers from MMC schools where *Sangati* Programme was implemented. A questionnaire was prepared and pre-tested. It was decided that 10 students from each school out of which 5 girls and 5 boys were to be selected using random sample method. It was also decided that in classes with were less than 10 students all students would be administered the questionnaire.

Detailed report about the same is as follows:

**Sample Number of schools, teacher and students evaluated under *Sangati* Programme**

![Graph showing sample number of schools, teachers, and students evaluated under *Sangati* Programme.](image)

It was decided that evaluation will be done in 81 schools, 81 teachers and 804 students.

**Teachers’ Feedback about *Sangati* Program**

- **Participation in *Sangati* Program**

  - *Sangati* programme is being implemented since 1990 in the Mumbai Municipal Corporation Schools. Since 2006, it is being implemented with all the std V to std VII students in the upper primary schools.
  
  - There are 12% teachers who have been teaching *Sangati* programme for the last 4-6 years, 6% and 7% teachers teaching *Sangati* programme for 7 to 12 years respectively. 40% teachers have taken this responsibility in the last 2 to 3 years and 25% of std VII teachers have taken up the responsibility for the first time.

- **Training Undergone for *Sangati***

  Since *Sangati* programme is implemented through teachers, they play a crucial role in the entire process. Out of the total teachers who are part of *Sangati* programme and are teaching std VII, 56% have participated in the training programme conducted under *Sangati* programme. There are 440 teachers since 2011, who are not yet trained for *Sangati* programme.
How the remaining teachers have conducted the *Sangati* session, in spite of not having undergone training.

The teachers used *Sangati* kits 5 and 6 with students in 2014-15. The teachers conducted the sessions without training workshops. 71% of teachers said that *Sangati* representative gave adequate and appropriate orientation. 22% of teachers self-read the ‘Teacher’s Manual’ and prepared themselves independently and conducted the sessions.

Who conducts *Sangati* sessions?

45% of teachers conduct the *Sangati* session themselves. *Sangati* representative reach out to every class to find out about implementation of *Sangati* programme. They also help in conducting Games and assisting with student’s Worksheets. In 47% schools, the programme is implemented by teachers but assisted by the *Sangati* representatives. There were 4% schools that had conducted *Sangati* very well when the current batch of children were in Classes V and VI. However; these classes did not have regular teachers and/or had teachers who resisted taking the sessions. In these schools *Sangati* was implemented under the guidance of the field representatives and by the students themselves (reading and discussing the structured information) and by taking on the facilitator’s role. Thus in 92% schools, teachers play a central role in conducting *Sangati* programme.

*Sangati* sessions are conducted once a week in 82% schools.

Is it easy to conduct *Sangati* in classes without training workshops?

77% teachers said that *Sangati* syllabus and the teaching methodology is so very interesting and innovative that the programme can be implemented without participating in the training programme. 13% teachers said that it is somewhat possible.

“We are happy and satisfied while conducting the *Sangati* programme”

83% teachers said that since the structuring of sessions is excellent and hence, in spite of having other workload and responsibilities, we are happy and satisfied while conducting the sessions. The teachers recorded that they can see that the students enjoy the sessions and there is a definite change in the students.

Do you think *Sangati* programme is complementary to the school curriculum?

Various important themes/topics are included in the programme and hence, it is complementary to the school curriculum. 81% teachers feel that it strengthens School curriculum whereas 14% teachers feel that it is somewhat complementary.
Which school subjects does Sangati complement/enhances?

The table given below explains how Sangati topics are useful and which subjects it complements/enhances the most. It can be deduced from the table that the information/issues in Sangati sessions is useful for. It is seen that 81%, 18%, 18% relevance is found in History, Geography, Science, Environment studies & Civil Science.

Is Sangati Syllabus relevant for students?

46% teachers feel that Sangati syllabus is completely relevant. 42% teachers feel that it is relevant to a great extent. It is a special point that not a single teacher feels that it is not relevant at all.

Is the attendance of students positively influenced on days when Sangati is conducted?

It is the experience of 64% of teachers that attendance of students during on days when Sangati sessions are held increases significantly. 21% teachers feel that the attendance is slightly more on days when Sangati sessions are held. 14% feel that sangati sessions do not affect attendance of students.

Participation of students during Sangati sessions

Students’ active participation is the key to the success of Sangati sessions. The classroom transaction is based on varied interactive methods providing a platform to students to express their opinions, thoughts, ideas. Hence 31% teachers feel that the participation of children is Excellent. 56% feel that participation of children is Very Good during Sangati sessions.

Which values are communicated is inculcated with the help of Sangati programme?

Respect for others, being open to contemporary social issues and concerns, developing scientific attitude with a positive mind-set of looking at in society, being aware of and acting against discrimination on the basis of caste, class, gender etc. could be learnt in depth. The teachers feel that Sangati sessions have guided students well.

Has Sangati helped you as a Teacher?

82% teachers feel that Sangati programme is useful even for teachers. 17% teachers feel that it is somewhat useful. Sangati programme is complementary to all the subjects and is useful as it has a lot of easy to use material related with other subjects.

What changes have you observed in the students due to Sangati Sessions?

Various capacities and skills can be built through Sangati programme as can be seen in the table given below: Most of the teachers feel that students’ capacities and skills are being built and nurtured well due to Sangati. Teachers have observed that Sangati programme has brought about positive changes in students.

Significant Changes observed in Students

It has been observed that changes in students, is at several levels and in varied manner. 36% teachers feel that Sangati programme has helped in personality development of students. It has built confidence to speak, their self-image has received positive boost. It has motivated them to enhance their thought process, build positive attitude, built cooperative spirit. It is the experience of 33% teachers that the programme has been useful in inculcating values that are important to become a responsible citizen.
Students’ Feedback about *Sangati* Program

- **Like *Sangati* Programme because**

  Students like the *Sangati* Programme a lot. The project got feedback of 804 students about *Sangati* three options were given about their option: 'Like *Sangati* 'Do Not Like *Sangati*' and 'Do Not Know'. The responses were as follows: **99%** students have shared that they like *Sangati*, **0%** 'Do Not Like' and **1%** 'Do Not Know'.

- **What do you like most in *Sangati* Programme?**

  Students love stories, games and flipcharts. There are a lot of stories, games and flip charts in *Sangati* programme. **55%** students liked these in particular. **16%** students like drawings and posters. It can thus be deduced that drawings, posters, games, worksheets and information booklet play a very important role in the increase in comprehension skills, reading and writing skills of students.

- **Reasons for liking *Sangati***

  *Sangati* programme is built in such a way that it will strengthen the school curriculum. Lot of thinking and preparation has gone into *Sangati*. It includes various games, stories, songs which students would like and they can participate in. Different flipcharts and posters having lot of pictures have been prepared on different topics. The students like it a lot. The students have expressed their reactions about the programme as follows. We will see that the students like all the options in a similar proportion.

  **Do you get opportunity to express your opinions during *Sangati* session?**

  The children like the programmes as it uses different tools and mediums. Participation of children is the base of the entire programme. That is how the programme reaches out to children. **89%** students shared that they have got a platform to express their thoughts, their opinions during *Sangati* sessions. **3%** students gave a negative answer.

- **We and our friends attend *Sangati* sessions**

  **96%** students shared that they enjoy the *Sangati* session thoroughly. Hence, they make it a point to attend school on the day the session is conducted. Their friends also attend *Sangati* sessions regularly. It is a very important point that they enjoy the sessions and attend the sessions with friends.

- **Get information about other things during *Sangati* Programme.**

  **90%** students feel that they get latest information about different subjects. **9%** students feel that they get some additional information about different subjects.

- **Has there been any change in you because of *Sangati* Programme?**

  **81%** students feel that there is a change in them due to *Sangati* Programme. **64%** feel that there is change in other students.

- **What changes have happened due to *Sangati* Programme?**

  **37%** students mentioned inculcating (Gender, Caste, Religion) values. **19%** students got in to habit of reading, writing, and studies. **37%** student's knowledge and confidence level increased. Thus the *Sangati* Programme was useful in personality development.
2.10 Achievements of the Programme

The Mumbai Municipal Corporation Education Department has extended invaluable support for implementation of this programme.

All the Mumbai Municipal School Principals, teachers, students and all the officers extended their invaluable support for the implementation of the programme in the school.

Participation of teachers and students in Sangati programme: the teachers and students take special interest while teaching learning and they find the information new. Students participate in the games, information, stories enthusiastically. On the whole, the response of teachers and students is positive.

86% of schools have completed Kit No 5. The life in today’s world is fast changing, is explained from 20 sessions in the Kit. Changes in the lives of students, continuous change happening in the society, physical changes in adolescence, industrialization, privatization, political changes, problems in the society, their attitude towards the problems, changing values etc points are explained through games, stories and information.

70% of schools have completed Kit No 6. As the students understand Self esteem, they learnt necessary skills and life values required to strengthen themselves. Total 16 sessions explain Self image, understanding self, being aware about own qualities and work towards enhancing them, finding own life values and developing own personality accordingly, being able to communicate, being able to cope with stress, being able to solve problems, constructive planning in order to travel for successful future, taking firm decisions etc life skills are explained to the students through the sessions.

Physical Changes happening in an individual were explained in the session – Vayat Yetana (becoming an adolescent) and they got information about a very sensitive and relevant topic. Many a times, this topic is not discussed either at school or at home. Hence, information about physical, emotional, intellectual or psychological changes has been explained through pictures, letters and situations. The students get the right direction and comfort and they share their experiences without any hesitation. Their doubts and questions are resolved.

Out of the total students, 7363 students (24% ) preparing files compiling Gammat Goshti, is an important point. This has encouraged hidden talent of students.
2.11 Challenges faced during Implementation of the Programme

- It was difficult to complete the Kit in Class VII as they had scholarship exams, British Council Training. However, this was taken for granted.
- There were some teachers who completed Sangati programmes in Class V and class VI. However, the same could not be completed for class VII due to their scholarship exams.
- In some schools especially Marathi, Gujarati, Tamil, Telugu and Kannad schools, some classes were combined due to lesser number of students. In some places, class VII was closed down. Hence, Sangati programme could not reach these classes.
- 4-5 Sangati representatives were less. Hence, there were problems in implementation.
- Some schools asked the project to take back the Sangati kit from their schools and hence, the programme was not implemented in those schools.
At glance developments during the Academic Year 2015-16 (June to September)

On 18th April 2015 the Municipal Corporation renewed its permission for implementation of Sangati Programme in all the Upper Primary Schools during June 2015 to April 2018 (PPPC/39 date 18/04/15. During the academic year 2015-16, Sangati programme are implementing in all the teachers and students of eight mediums of Mumbai Municipal Schools. Three batches of std V to std VII have undergone Sangati using it as a supplementary, enrichment curriculum. Mumbai Municipal’s Education Department has extended excellent support during the implementation.

The project is making efforts to implement Sangati programme in a progressive manner for this phase i.e. from June 2015 to April 2018. As part of these plans the project is currently implementing the Sangati programme for std V during the current academic year (2015-2016). (Next Year (2016-17) VI and Next to next year (2017-18) VII standard)

Sangati Programme Outreach 2015-16

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zone</th>
<th>No of schools</th>
<th>No of classes</th>
<th>No of Teachers</th>
<th>No of Secondary School</th>
<th>No of classes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>292</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>291</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>468</td>
<td>512</td>
<td>512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>323</td>
<td>542</td>
<td>534</td>
<td>534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grant Total</td>
<td>808</td>
<td>858</td>
<td>1302</td>
<td>1344</td>
<td>1344</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Sangati kit 1- Myself, My Body, Our Needs is being implemented - during the first half of this academic year (June 2015- Dec/Jan 2016).

- During academic year 2015-16 Sangati programme was implemented in 1344 classes from 858 upper primary schools covering 8 mediums. Newly Sangati programme is implementing in Secondary schools. In the current academic year 52 Secondary schools and 74 classes have been added.

- A total of 1344 classes from Upper Primary and 74 classes from secondary schools and teachers are now participating in the programme.
A brief outline of Kit 1- Myself, My Body, Our Needs:

The SANGATI series begins by getting children to understand ‘Myself’ or ‘Who I am’. There are nine sessions on this topic. Each session focuses on one aspect of the self or society that gives a person her identity. Thus, starting with the physical self and the emotional self, the sessions explore a variety of influences on a child: the family, the school, friends, the media, and the city environment in which he or she lives. They help children to see how these influences combine to make every individual unique.

The body is the most obvious part of the self. Which is why, after exploring the self, we move on to understanding 'My body'. This section contains twelve sessions that explore different aspects of the human body. The first seven sessions deal with the different systems of the body, while the next two take up the role of the mind and emotions and their link to the body. The tenth session deals with the changes that take place in the body as part of the process of growing up. The last two sessions give children an idea of the importance of taking care of the body in order to keep it in good health.

All human beings have the same basic needs. Apart from food, clothing, shelter, air and water, all of us also need education, work and recreation, care, love and security, to ensure our well-being. The two sessions in the section on 'Our needs' help children understand this simple but very important idea.

Though this is a short section, it is important because it brings into focus values that form the foundation of the SANGATI series: that in spite of having the same needs, people have different ways of fulfilling them; that this variety in ways of living enriches human life; that since it is the work of many different people that helps us fulfill our needs, human labour must be respected; that since all human beings share these needs, everyone should also have a right to fulfill them.
Implementation of Sangati programme in all upper primary and secondary Municipal schools of Mumbai

Sangati Programme (2015-16): Activities

- **Integration of School Curriculum and Sangati Programme:** In the year 2015-16, Sangati Programme Kit 1: ‘Myself, My Body, Our Needs’ has been used in the MMC schools as supplementary enrichment programme.

- **Refresher Training for staff:** Training workshop was conducted for staff for Sangati Kit 1: ‘Myself, My Body, Our Needs’. Focus of the training was to equip participants to develop an in-depth and nuanced understanding of Sangati kit 1 and to clarify doubts if any. The staff members had earlier read the kit on their own, had prepared a list of issues to be discussed. They had also conducted Zone-wise mock workshops/presentations. Background and rational for development of these kits was also revealed to the participants. The issues identified by the staff members and their doubts were discussed in contexts of each session. The senior members also shared their valuable experiences and insights with the new staff members. Possible situations in the schools, inputs for interactions with teachers, head teachers, officers were highlighted. Some content and pedagogy issues (quality in transaction, completing of children’s’ worksheets, storage of material, contentious topics like changes in adolescent children etc.) The workshop was held at K.K. Khade Municipal School on 16 to 18 June 2015 the workshop was guided by senior team members including the Director but it was essentially a peer-learning exercise.

- **Base-line and End-line Tests:** To understand and gauge the impact of the Avehi-Abacus programme on teachers and students; Base-line tests were developed and administered. In all a sample of 1839 students from 85 schools (10%) were part of these Base-line tests.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FC Name</th>
<th>No of schools</th>
<th>10%</th>
<th>No of Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zone I</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone II</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>759</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone III</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>746</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grant Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>85</strong></td>
<td><strong>85%</strong></td>
<td><strong>1839</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Meeting with Teachers and Head Teachers:** In the beginning of the academic year, head teachers of all the schools were given copies of the permission letters for the Sangati Programme. Head teachers were also given detail orientation of Sangati Kit 1: ‘Myself, My Body, Our Needs’. Detail planning for conducting Sangati Classes at school level, giving feed-back and encouragement to teachers, addressing their problems regarding time-table and storage of material etc.
• **Documentation of details of Participating Schools:** Existing tools were revised to document/update details regarding schools, teachers, and children of each school that is part of the Sangati programme.

• **Providing Sangati Kits to Schools:** In the month of April, detail information was gathered/updated about availability and requirement of Sangati Kits per school. Based on which new kits were printed and distributed to respective schools in the beginning of the academic year 2015-16 in month of July 15 (16 to 25 July).

• **Printing and distribution of Children’s’ Material: Worksheets/Supplementary Readings**

  40000 Activity booklets were printed and distributed to all participating children’s in 8 languages.

  Each booklet containing the relevant Worksheets/Supplementary Readings is prepared taking into consideration the age group of students. Each child is given the material in their own language of instruction. (Total 8 languages). The language therein is very easy to understand and the material is non-threatening. The primary focus is to enable the child to relate what the session addressed to their own life-situations rather than merely repeating what was transacted in different languages. The material has drawing, painting, information about one self, writing experiences, collecting some information, writing notes, interviewing – all the exercises, the students can carry out well.

• **Meetings with the officials in the Education Department:** In the year 2015-16, Sangati programme co-ordinators organised regular meetings with the education officials in their respective areas. These meetings were conducted with the Deputy Education Officers, Superintendents, Administrative and Beat Officers to provide regular programme updates and to brief them about organizational work. Officials provided guidance with respect to issues related to programme implementation. Their feedback and suggestions helped the implementing team.

• **Teacher’s Day Celebration:** Book Marks were gifted to teachers and to officials in the department of education on teacher’s day to express gratitude

• **Sangati Programme Implementation:** From July-15 to Aug-15; sessions based on Sangati Kit 1: ‘Myself, My Body, Our Needs’.
- **Sangati Programme Implementation**: Detail information about this is given below

**Sangati Programme in upper primary schools**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zone</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zone I</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone II</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone III</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| %     | 81 | 77 | 75 | 69 | 63 | 51 | 42 | 35 | 24 | 17 | 9  | 6  | 3  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 0.45 |

- Session 1 to 5 is completed in 63 to 81% of classes.
- Teachers began conducting the sessions as they found the topics in kit 1 relevant to the syllabus of science and related with real life. The visual aids were highly appreciated as tools to make complex concepts and ideas more accessible.
- The commitment and involvement of teachers towards their students is reflected in the feedback they have written.

- **Zone wise Average in % of sessions of Kit 1: ‘Myself, My Body, Our Needs’ Sangati Programme**
School Visits of School Representatives and Coordinators: June to Sept. 2015

There are 7 Field Coordinators and 45 School Representatives who monitor the implementation of the *Sangati* Programme. They have taken lot of efforts so that the *Sangati* is implemented as expected and the outcomes of the programme are achieved by keeping in constant touch with teachers, head-teacher, officers, by attending sessions, assisting in Children’s’ feedback, maintaining case-studies and process-documentation, etc.

---

- **School Visits by Coordinators** – the seven coordinators responsible for three Zones made 210 school visits and 292 class visits. Out of which, 177 were regular visits, 58 surprise visits and 57 visits were made to the classes having varied problems. During school visits, they had dialogue with teachers, principals and with the students for smooth functioning of *Sangati* programme.

- **School visits by Representatives** – There are 45 School Representatives made a total 3938 visits to the schools after the commencement of the academic year in mid June. Out of which, 2701 visits were for observing the sessions and 1237 visits were for follow-up.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zone</th>
<th>Visited No of schools</th>
<th>Visited No of classes</th>
<th>No. of Visits for Observing Sessions</th>
<th>No. of Visits for Follow up of Sessions</th>
<th>Visited No of schools</th>
<th>Visited No of classes</th>
<th>No. of Visits by Field coordinator (Classes)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Regular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone I</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>324</td>
<td>554</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone II</td>
<td>348</td>
<td>537</td>
<td>1280</td>
<td>472</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zone III</td>
<td>326</td>
<td>542</td>
<td>867</td>
<td>602</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grant Total</td>
<td>894</td>
<td>1403</td>
<td>2701</td>
<td>1237</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>292</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Teachers’ and Student response to Sangati kit 1:

- Students who usually do not speak or participate in the class have become active during Sangati and also in other classes. They exhibit great interest and enthusiasm during Sangati sessions.
- Students enjoy drawing, colouring worksheets in their booklet.
- Students have enjoyed writing about themselves, their likes-dislikes, about their friends, and family.
- The Sangati programme supplements various school subjects like Geography, Social and General Science, Environmental Studies, languages etc. The programme has contributed in enhancing student’s knowledge and the use of various methods of classroom-transaction like group activities, games, songs has enriched the teaching-learning process and made it entertaining as well as non-threatening.
- Since the programme supplements various school subjects teachers have used Sangati visual aids and activities during their regular classes throughout the academic year. For e.g. Many teachers have used visual aids to conduct the lessons on ‘Different Body Systems’ in General Science, health and hygiene. The teachers feel that the use of visual aids help students understands and retain the content in a better manner.
- The Sangati programme has contributed in enhancing various skills like communication, leadership, group-work amongst students. It has increased their confidence and helped in creating a ‘we’ feeling in the classrooms.
- Thus as the implementation began the programme has received an enthusiastic response from both teachers with previous experience and those new to Sangati.
Manthan Programme

At glance developments during the period of April to Sept 2015 - -----------------------------48-63

- Introduction
- Objectives of Manthan
- Field Outreach
- Programmes implemented under Manthan Project during 2014-15
- About Syllabus in Manthan Programme
- The session average of Manthan programme implemented in teachers’ training colleges
- Manthan Programme: Internal Evaluation Report
- Positive Points experienced during implementation of Manthan Programme
- Feedback given by Trainee Teachers about Manthan Programme
3. *Manthan* Programme

**At glance developments during the period of April to Sept 2015**

3.1 Introduction:

Avehi Abacus has also prepared *Manthan* curriculum which complements the teachers’ training syllabus. *Manthan* is prepared considering National syllabus for D. Ed., National Primary Outline 2005, recent changes done in National Curriculum Framework for Teacher Education 2009 recognised by NCTE. It was implemented in Raigad district. We got excellent cooperation from District Education and Training Institute, Panvel.

*Manthan* Programme was implemented in four teachers’ training colleges in Pavel block with the cooperation of District Education and Training Institute, Panvel. The feedback we received from trainee teachers, from teacher educators and from the principals were quite encouraging and positive. Considering the feedback about its impact and usefulness, the State Teachers Education Board (SBTE) and Maharasthra State Educational Research and Training Institute, Pune gave the permission to implement the programme in 10 teachers’ training colleges in Raigad district during the academic year 2013-15. (Ref: Permission Letter MSERTI/SBTE/Avehi Abacus/3750/2013) and then it was implemented in 10 teachers’ training colleges in Raigad district during 2013-15.

3.2 Objectives of *Manthan*:

- To help teacher educators and trainee teachers reflect on their own roles and critically understand the key role played by teachers in society
- To encourage and motivate teacher educators and trainee teachers to seek alternatives to the existing system of hierarchical relationships and move towards a more inclusive and democratic classroom
- To facilitate teachers’ self-growth and improve pedagogic skills
- To critically analyses school syllabus and use it creatively and expand its potential
- To draw linkages between school subjects and connect what is taught in school with the world outside

3.3 Field Outreach:

The project was granted permission by the Maharashtra State Council for Educational Research and Training for field testing of the module in Panvel DIET (District Institute of Educational Training) and 9 other affiliated colleges in 2014-15. In the current academic year 2014-2015 *Manthan* is being implemented with 10 teacher educators and 250 trainee teachers.
Importance of *Manthan* Programme

- The entire syllabus complements D T Ed syllabus.
- Teaching gets a direction due to informal methods such as different games, stories, songs in the *Manthan* Programme.
- Teachers develop a skill to encourage brave thoughts of students.
- It is useful for personality development and self awareness.
- It is useful to store information and analysis.
- It is useful to present information using teaching learning material.

3.4 Programmes implemented under *Manthan*

**Meeting with Principal Mr. Gajanan Patil** – The project had started in District Educational Training Institute, Panvel. However, no meeting could not be organized with Principal for a long time. When we went to meet Reader Ms. Manisha Pawar, we got a golden opportunity to meet the Principal. He listened to the Project activities and report of 2013-14 of *Manthan* programme. He also discussed the outcome of the programme and funds received for the programme. He leafed through the *Manthan* material, questioned us about our experiences while implementing the programme. It was decided that another meeting will be organized to discuss cooperation and becoming resource person for ‘in service training’.

**Visits to teachers’ training colleges**

Two periods per week were given for implementation of the *Manthan* sessions. It was also decided that the representative would visit once a week for material distribution. The trainee teachers and their teacher educators got guidance for problems in implementation and for use of material distributed. Since there is shortage of teachers in District Education Training Institute, the programme is implemented through NGO representatives.

**Evaluation**

Programme Evaluation was conducted at the end of April May to understand implementation of *Manthan* and its feedback. Written feedback was taken from 7 teacher educators and 92 trainee teachers.
• The second year course was completed in all the 10 colleges (Panvel DIET district Raigad)

• The overall feedback from students for the second year course reveals that they have immensely benefitted from the programme as it supplements their regular curriculum and also contributed in creating a holistic perspective.

• Renewal of permission by Maharashtra State Council for Educational Research and Training to continue implementation of the Manthan programme for the academic years 2015-2018. Manthan proposal and last year Annual and Evaluation report 2014-15 has been sent to MSCERT.

• Recommendation for up-scaling by the Principal of Panvel DIET on the basis of the positive impact on students in earlier two years has also been sent.

• MSCERT's permission to continue implementation of Manthan programme in DTEd colleges affiliated to Panvel District Institute of Educational Training is still under process.

• Meanwhile the Programme is expanded to 10 DTEd colleges affiliated to Thane District Institute of Educational Training (DIET)

• Distribution of Certificates to Participating Teachers educators and trainee-teachers: To acknowledge the participant’s contribution in the implementation of the programme in D. Ted colleges and to express gratitude, participation certificates were given to Teachers educators and trainee teachers.
3.5 About Syllabus in *Manthan* Programme

What is it that a teacher can do? Obviously, problems that are deep-rooted and systemic cannot be resolved overnight. However, it is indeed possible to initiate the process of change – to be aware of the critical issues in our education system, to understand the close link between education and society, to realize the potential of education as a tool for social transformation and recognize that the teacher can act as a catalyst for such change.

The course content covers two of the three curricular areas prescribed by the National Council of Teacher Education – namely, Foundations of Education and Curriculum and Pedagogy.

The course consists of fifty sessions in all, with twenty-five sessions to be conducted each year. The sessions in the first year are divided into five modules: *The Teacher: Playing Many Roles; The Child: Special in Different Ways; Learning: Thinkers and Theories; Education in India: A Story of Continuity and Change, and Education in India: Curriculum, Methodology, Assessment*. The second year focuses on Education and Society, and explores topics of current concern such as inequalities of gender, caste and class; communalism, nationalism, war and violence; and issues related to development and the environment. These sessions will not only help trainees understand their rapidly changing world but also how these issues are reflected in the school curriculum.
3.6 The session average of *Manthan* programme implemented in teachers’ training colleges till April 2015 is as follows

**Session average of Manthan Kit 2**

- District Education and Training Institute, Panvel had number of activities in the month of March and attendance of trainee teachers was less in the end. Hence, 12 sessions in the *Manthan* syllabus for second year could not be completed.

- The teacher educators from Veshwi Teachers’ Training College got transferred and attendance of trainee teachers was less in the end. Hence, 12 sessions in the *Manthan* syllabus for second year could not be completed.

- They got habituated to additional reading because of the supplementary reading sheets.

- The trainee teachers shared that their previous misunderstandings about discrimination on the basis of caste, gender, abuse etc. got cleared due to discussions and the sessions conducted.

Manthan programme was evaluated internally at the end of March 2015 to understand its implementation, understand feedback from the student/trainee teachers and teacher educators. Written responses were obtained from teacher educators implementing Manthan and trainee teachers.

Feedback of Trainee Teachers about Manthan Programme

- Like Manthan Programme because :
  Out of the total 92 trainee teachers who gave feedback about Manthan programme, all the 92 trainee teachers like the Programme.

  The reasons are as follows:
  Include games, songs, stories – 16% trainee teachers have mentioned that Manthan programme includes games, songs, stories.
  - Different Pictorial Material
    14% trainee teachers opined that there are lots of visual aids based on various topics. This factor can be used to make the topic easy and simple.

  - Participation in the Classroom
    Manthan programme includes questions relevant to each factor, which helps students to express their opinion freely. 18% trainee teachers feel that this factor is very useful and the trainee teachers try and express themselves freely.

  - Become aware about the reality, Thought Provoking
    52% trainee teachers have opined that it is an effort to make them aware about realities in the surrounding, effort to present the reality in social, political, educational field. As a teacher educator, it is very important to be aware about surroundings. Trainee teachers are of the opinion that the trainee teachers get exposure to new value-framework, as well as innovative information, technology and skills through Manthan. Thus, Manthan is liked because it is thought-provoking.

  - Get information of other topics through Manthan Programme
    98% trainee teachers said that Manthan includes various topics that are relevant to D.TEd. syllabus and through Manthan they get relevant and updated information and inputs about various subjects.

  - Following things were innovative in Manthan programme
    Manthan programme includes innovative teaching learning methods, supplementary reading, opportunity to express thoughts, latest knowledge, games, discussions, group activity, debates and dialogues making teaching learning interesting.
Changes in self, in other students because of Manthan programme

The trainee teachers feel that Manthan has brought about changes in themselves and in other classmates as well. 46% trainee teachers expressed that it has helped in their overall personality development. 57% trainee teachers feel that it has brought about changes in others’ personality as well. All the above responses can be summarized as follows:

After successful implementation in D TEd training colleges, of Manthan programme, for two years, it can be concluded that here have be changes in attitudes of trainee teachers as well as in thoughts and ideas. The direction of thoughts of these future teachers has taken a new turn, deepening and broadening their understanding relating to learning, education and society.

Feedback of Teacher Educators about Manthan Programme

- Manthan programme was implemented for first and second year trainee teachers with the ten teachers’ training colleges during 2014-15. No training could be conducted for the teacher educators due to unavailability of time. The project coordinator oriented the teacher educators about the syllabus and methodology. The teacher educators did self-study and conducted sessions with trainee teachers. The teacher educators filled-in a questionnaire. Following are the responses received from teacher educators of seven teachers’ training colleges.

- Sessions are conducted once a week in all the seven teachers’ training colleges. Out of which, all sessions were conducted by teacher educators in six teachers’ training colleges. The project coordinator conducts follow-up of the sessions and discussion with reference to reading and action sheets. However, due to unavailability of teacher educators in District Education and Training college, Panvel, implementation of Manthan was the responsibility of Project Coordinator right from the beginning. All the teacher educators experienced that implementation of Manthan programme is very easy.

- 50% teachers implementing Manthan programme have more than eight years of experience of teaching. 17% teachers have experience between four to eight years. 2 teachers who gave feedback about Manthan programme have less than four years of experience. These teachers have been associated with Manthan programme since 2013.

- Syllabus in Manthan programme is complementary to the syllabus in teachers’ training college. The issues, concepts and information in Manthan are useful in teaching regular subjects.
All the teacher educators and trainee teachers mentioned that *Manthan* programme is complementary to their own syllabus. The information and concepts about languages, history, ‘general knowledge’, Indian Society, Primary Education, Child Psychology, School Management, Work Experience, and Value Education is useful in teaching first and second year syllabus.

*Manthan* programme includes different topics covered in D.TEd. syllabus. All the 100% trainee teachers said that *Manthan* programme is complementary to D. TEd. syllabus. It co-relates to curriculum in following subjects. Subject wise information is given below:

*Manthan* programme co-relates with the D.TEd. syllabus. It is particularly close to ‘History, Science, Environmental Studies Geography, and Civic Science’ about 45% students reported this.

**Participation of Trainee Teachers in *Manthan* Sessions**

Out of the total seven, participation of trainee teachers from four teachers’ training colleges, was excellent. Participation was also good in the remaining three colleges.

**Experience during *Manthan* Sessions**

It is clearly indicative from the feedback obtained from 33% Teacher Educators that the trainee teachers who never expressed their opinion, have started expressing freely and participating actively. 28% teacher educators said that their confidence level has grown due to active participation.

**Gains from *Manthan* Programmes as Teacher Educators**

All the Teacher Educators expressed that *Manthan* programme was very useful. The teacher educators had to rank the given options from 1 to 7. (rank 1 to the most useful and rank 7 to the least useful.) The details are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr No</th>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Rank 1</th>
<th>Rank 2</th>
<th>Rank 3</th>
<th>Rank 4</th>
<th>Rank 5</th>
<th>Rank 6</th>
<th>Rank 7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Acquiring New Information</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Useful to Strengthen Regular Syllabus</td>
<td>28.57</td>
<td>28.57</td>
<td>28.57</td>
<td>14.29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- **Special changes you experience in yourself due to *Manthan* Programme**
  This programme raised knowledge level, developed innovative ideas to make teaching learning material. It encourages thinking, reflection, analysis, critical observation regarding important issues and concerns in our society. It is also adds to enthusiasm.

- **Special Changes brought about in Trainee Teachers by *Manthan* Programme**
  Teacher Educators from all the teachers’ training college opined that *Manthan* programme brought about confidence, courage to speak out, participate in debate, discussion, dialogues, role plays, group activities etc. The trainee teachers have developed the technique to prepare and use teaching learning material. It motivates thinking process. It has contributed in increased cooperative feelings. 62% teacher educators experienced that the programme has developed overall personality of the trainee teachers.
Feedback of Trainee Teachers about *Manthan* Programme

**Ms. Nutan Rajaram Patil, Government Teachers’ Training College, Sasawane**

*Manthan* programme was implemented for two years. The training given by that organization is very useful. Our thought process and outlook towards the society changed. They gave us knowledge about use of different teaching learning methods. They gave us lot of useful reading material. This programme encouraged our different talents. Other trainee teachers should also get the benefit of this programme. They should also get different information that we got. We are thankful to the organization which made us aware about the situation around us and the problems therein.

**Ms. Kunika Kamalakar Rohekar, Indian Education Society’s Teachers’ Training College - Nagothane**

*Manthan* programme was really very good. We got lot of different information during their sessions. Each of the sessions contained something different. We got good information from their session – Dnyan Dene and Dnyan Ghene (Give and Take Knowledge). Lot of information was given on casteism, discrimination, role of teachers, blind beliefs, self awareness etc. We got to see new and different types of flip charts. Every time we were learning something new through the games that were conducted.

This information is really valuable for us as future teachers. It is very useful in the future. We got new and different information through their supplementary reading.

**Namrata Chandrakant Raut, Government Teachers’ Training College, Mangaon**

*Manthan* programme is educationally very useful. The syllabus is relevant to D T Ed syllabus and hence, could be digested easily.

All the topics in the syllabus are very important which added to our knowledge. The games in the programme were quite interesting and also gave some important message. We were always hopeful that we will get to learn something new and different as the teaching style was also different. So there was always an enthusiasm while learning during syllabus.

I liked the teaching methodology part the most in this syllabus. It changed my way of thinking. We did not have in depth knowledge about our own country – India, in spite of being an Indian resident. Through this Manthan syllabus, I got an in depth knowledge about my own country. This syllabus is going to be really useful in my future life.
3.8 Positive Points experienced during implementation of *Manthan* Programme

Maharashtra State Educational Research and Training Institute, Pune gave permission to implement the *Manthan* Programme in 10 teachers’ training colleges in Raigad district.

Since *Manthan* programme complemented the syllabus, all the Principals and teacher educators from Teachers’ Training Colleges in Raigad district showed enthusiasm to implement the programme during 2013-15 academic year, in 10 teachers’ training colleges.

*Manthan* Coordinators got good cooperation from all the teacher educators, trainee teachers and Principals from teachers’ training colleges.

The information given in *Manthan* programme was complementary to D T Ed syllabus and hence found to be useful for teaching learning.

Participation of trainee teachers in the programme helped them develop the skill of expressing their opinion with confidence.

Skills to use games, discussion, dialogue, debate etc methods while teaching learning was developed. The trainee teachers understood the impact of teaching methodology and developed the skill to prepare and use teaching aids.

**Problems:**

Implementation of *Manthan* programme started only in January 2014. Hence the syllabus for first year could not be completed in such short span of time. Then the same trainee teachers reached second year and for them, the first year syllabus of *Manthan* programme sessions were conducted. As a result, got lesser time to implement second year syllabus of *Manthan* programme. In some teachers’ training colleges, last few sessions were completed in a workshop method.
4. Networking Advocacy

We are going through different phases while advocating for Fundamental Right to Education.

The Right to Education law, 2009 came into existence from April 01, 2010. In spite of this law, classes for std VIII, have not been started in all the schools by Municipal Corporation in Mumbai and by State Government in the state. The three year period given in the law for implementation has also lapsed. However, Municipal Corporation and State Government are not taking any firm steps for implementation. In this background, some work was done in Ayodhya Nagar School of Municipal Corporation with the School Management Committee (2013-14), 88 children on the rolls of school and approximately 4000 children from 90 Municipal schools got class rooms for std VIII from 2014. Still lot of follow up needs to be done to start VIII std classes and for adequate teachers and basic facilities.

1. State Level Meeting to organize Shiksha Sangharsh Yatra (Campaign for Education March) – Organising Committee of Campaign against Corporatization of Education of Mumbai had a meeting on July 27th. Dr. Anil Sadgopal attended the meeting. A country level Shiksha Sangharsh Yatra has been organized by Akhil Bharatiya Shiksha Adhikar Manch. In order to form a Mumbai level Organising Committee for Shiksha Sangharsh Yatra at a broader level: A meeting was organized on August 9 to organize a Mumbai level Organising Committee for Shiksha Sangharsh Yatra at a broader level. A country level Shiksha Sangharsh Yatra has been organized by Akhil Bharatiya Shiksha Adhikar Manch. To oppose Commercialisation and Communalisation of Education would be the two main objectives of this Campaign. The point demanding starting of classes for std VIII immediately as per RTE act and giving free, compulsory and quality education till std XII in Municipal Schools in future, would also be emphasized. With this objective, Organising Committee, Convener Committee was formed in the presence of 33 members on August 27th. Another objective of the committees was to spread the signature campaign on a broader level. Resolutions in this regard were also passed. New Committee Members were also present for this meeting. the objective of this campaign of Akhil Bharatiya Shiksha Adhikar Manch was presented. This Campaign Struggle March started at Imphal, Manipur ( 2 November 2014) flagged by Irom Sharmila, the Iron Lady fighting AFSA through her 12 year Hunger Strike arrived in Maharashtra on August 3rd and culminated on December 03, 2014 in Bhopal. It was decided that the campaign would emphasize local level issues and make people aware about national level issues in all spares of education.

2. Meeting of representatives working on Right to Education – a meeting was organized by Mr. Sharad Jawdekar and Ms. Avisha Kulkarni of Samajwadi Adhyapak Sabha on February 21, 2015 to discuss admission of children with 25% reservation and amendments in Right to Education act. We participated in this meeting. The provision of 25% reservation is only a deceitful
provision. It gives scope to private sector in the name of Public Private Partnership. The Government provides nominal fees. Parents have to pay all the balance fees. In this background, all the loopholes in the Act should be publicized. We should work with people about School Management Committee. As a result, the Government Schools would improve.

3. Visit to Nationalised Congress Party (NCP) Member Ms. Chitra Wagh on February 28, 2015 – We had a meeting with NCP member Ms. Chitra Wagh to discuss that around 4 lakhs students have not got the provision in RTE, of free education till std VIII. We gave her a memorandum to raise a Question in Legislative Assembly about the same. She promised to raise the question in Legislative Assembly.

Achievements

1. Classes for std VIII started in Ayodhya Nagar Municipal School for 88 children and adequate teachers for the same were also provided.
2. Adequate teachers were also provided for std I, II and IV in Ayodhya Nagar School.
3. Definite signs are seen that proposal for reconstruction of these schools has reached the Commissioner and that work would be initiated very soon.
4. The School Management Committee has focused on School. They themselves have got involved with interest in the functioning of school.
5. A writ petition was filed through Equal Education Fundamental Right Committee, about permission given to an illegal private school in Transit Camp Bimbisar Nagar Municipal School in Goregaon(2012). The Child Rights Commission had given decision in June 2012 that it is illegal to run a private school in Municipal Schools as per RTE Act of 2009, Child Rights Protection Act 2006 and Mumbai Municipal Corporation Act 1888. They had also given directives to conduct an enquiry of officers involved in this situation. The enquiry of six concerned officers is ongoing under Chief Auditor and has reached final stage.
5. The Silver Jubilee Programme of Avehi Abacus Project

Avehi Abacus project was initiated in Municipal School in the year 1990. It completed 25 years on April 17, 2015. The organization has received excellent cooperation from students, teachers, principals of Municipal Schools as well as the officers of Education Department. A silver jubilee programme was organized to thank all the guides, partners, witnesses especially in Principal B. N. Vaidya Hall of Raja Shivaji Vidyalaya, Dadar(E) from 4.30 to 7.30 in the evening.

About 500 students, teachers, principals, officers, NGO representatives participated in this programme. This programme was anchored by Executive Committee Member of Avehi Abacus Project Ms. Ratna Pathak Shah.

Ms. Ratna Pathak Shah was the Master of Ceremony and enthralled the audience by her presence of mind and humour.

Inauguration of the Programme:

Famous artist Mr. Naseeruddin Shah, student representative Ms. Alasaba Ansari, teacher representative Ms. Suchita Nagawekar, Ms. Nandini Purandare, Ms. Chitra Patil inaugurated the programme.

Important points raised by Simantini Dhuru, Project Director of Avehi Abacus while presenting review of the journey

“Smt. Shanta Gandhi (who was awarded Padmashree Award in 1984) brought people from various fields together and tried connecting general sciences and social sciences with real life, for students from municipality schools.

This journey of 25 years would not have been possible without the immense support of the students, teachers and officers of the municipality schools.

The present classroom scenario is such that everyone participates wholeheartedly, share their experiences, express their opinions and moreover listen to others and think over it. What an ideal democracy should be like, inculcating self-confidence in students and remain optimistic about future is what their focus lies on today.
When children from all sections of society look up to municipality schools for quality education, then it would definitely bring in equality. This is what we are striving for.”

She thanked everyone for taking out their precious time to remain present for this program.

The importance and benefits about **Sangati** programme was expressed by 4 students and 2 teachers representing students, teachers, principals and officers who had participated in the programme. They shared the importance of **Sangati** programme.

The Trustees of Avehi, many well-wishers, academicians, representatives from other organisations, representatives of funding agencies came to show their support.

Accalaimed actor Naseeruddin Shah’s play ‘Gad-Ha and Gadh-ha’ written by Kishan Chandar and directed by Naseeruddin Shah was presented free of cost by the theatre group ‘MOTLEY’ for the audience. ‘MOTLEY’ also made financial and contribution for hiring of the auditorium. Danish Hussain, Faisal Rishad, Aniruddh Rawal, Sahil Vaidya, Dhruv Kalra, Rushil Sharma and Rakesh Om were Naseeruddin Shah’s co-actors. All the participants liked the play very much.

Smt. Ratna Pathak-Shah concluded the program with a vote of thanks to the participants and the organizers.

---

**Feedback of the Silver Jubilee Program:**

Mr. Shaikh Imran, Sant Kakayya Marg, Municipality Hindi School No.1, Dharavi:

**Sangati** Program took place in a big hall in Raja Shivaji Vidyalaya. Many students were present over there. Positive things were told about the program. We were shown a play. We learnt from the play that we should never abuse anyone, never tell lies and always be in the company of good people.

Ms. Noorsaba, Sant Kakayya Marg, Municipality Hindi School No.1, Dharavi:

We really liked the silver jubilee program. There were many students and teachers from different schools. This program was organized by **Sangati**. We got to learn from the play...
6. Work along with Central and State Level Government and other organizations

- Over the years the project has established linkages with National and State level Institutions like the National Council for Educational Research and Training (NCERT), Maharashtra Prathmik Shikhsan Parishad and Maharashtra State Council for Educational Research and Training (MSCERT). The Environmental studies textbook cum workbook for std III to std V of NCERT not only have parts of *Sangati* but also reflect the *Sangati* pedagogy.

- The project Director has been nominated by the Ministry of Human Resources Development to be a part of the Executive Committee of National Mission of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan. She is also a part of the revision committee of the DTEd course and the Chairperson of EVS school syllabus committee formed by MSCERT.

- The Maharashtra State Council for Educational Research and Training (MSCERT) has undertaken the process of syllabus review (for std I to VIII). The project Director has worked as the Chairperson for the Resource Group on Environmental Studies. The resource group finalised the detailed syllabus for std I to V.

- The Project Director is also a part of the Core-Committee responsible for the Syllabus Renewal taken up by the State Bureau of Teacher Education, MSCERT.

- **Work done to Revise and Restructure the syllabus of Pre-Service Teachers’ Training Course**
  The National Centre For Teacher Education (NCTE) has prepared a National Curriculum Framework in 2010 for pre service teachers’ education. Restructuring of syllabus of teachers training college was initiated on the basis of this NCF. Project Director Ms. Simantini Dhuru was involved in the process as a Core Committee Member of Syllabus Committee appointed by State Teachers’ Training Board. She participated in the fortnightly meetings organized by Maharashtra State Educational Research and Training Institute.

- **Meeting about Training Material for Std V and std VI in Primary Education Syllabus 2012**
  It is planned that the State syllabus for std V and VI will change for academic year 2015-16. The syllabus development committee has completed training material development process for std V and VI. As per the order of Minister for Education, a meeting was organized at Maharashtra Prathamik Shikshan Parishad, Mumbai on January 21, 2015, to discuss the training material prepared, so that the training becomes effective. Project Director Ms. Simantini Dhuru participated in the meeting.